

The Rt Hon Jeremy Hunt MP
Secretary of State for Health
Richmond House
79 Whitehall
London SW1A 2NS

27 March 2013

Dear Secretary of State

**REFERRAL TO SECRETARY OF STATE FOR HEALTH
New Health Deal for Trafford
Trafford and Manchester Joint Health Scrutiny Committee**

Thank you for forwarding copies of the referral letter and supporting documentation from Cllrs Eddy Newman and Judith Lloyd, Chair and Vice-Chair, Trafford and Manchester Joint Health Scrutiny Committee (JHOSC). NHS Northwest provided initial assessment information. A list of all the documents received is at Appendix One.

The IRP has undertaken an initial assessment, in accordance with our agreed protocol for handling contested proposals for the reconfiguration of NHS services. The IRP considers each referral on its merits and its advice in this case is set out below. **The Panel concludes that this referral is not suitable for full review.**

Background

Work on the development of integrated care systems in Trafford began in 2008 with the intention of enabling more care and support to be delivered locally in community settings and reducing the need for hospital-based care. Between 2008 and 2010, a range of events sought views from clinicians, stakeholders and the public including a clinical congress, deliberative events, open public board meetings and the formation of a citizens' panel.

The *New Health Deal for Trafford* project was established in October 2011, overseen by a Strategic Programme Board operating with delegated authority from NHS Greater Manchester. Local stakeholders were invited to participate in the project, both in developing understanding of why healthcare services in Trafford needed to change and in devising alternative models of care. A pre-consultation engagement phase began in late 2011, including public listening events, liaison with community groups, focus groups with seldom heard population groups, and online and telephone surveys. Key elements of the programme were outlined to Trafford HOSC.

In January 2012, an Integrated Care Redesign Board (ICRB - reporting to the Strategic Programme Board) was established to review and test clinical models of care emerging from the New Health Deal for Trafford programme.

Trafford Healthcare NHS Trust was acquired on 1 April 2012 by Central Manchester University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust.

Option appraisal undertaken during May 2012 considered a long list of options and reduced this to a short list before identifying a single option to consult on. The single option was agreed by the Strategic Programme Board following consideration and advice from the National Clinical Advisory Team (NCAT).

Updates on the process for formal consultation were provided to Trafford and Manchester HOSCs in June 2012, including sharing the pre-consultation business case and proposed consultation documents.

A public consultation, *A New Health Deal for Trafford*, was launched in July 2012 and ran for 14 weeks. The consultation presented a vision for providing integrated care - shifting care from hospital-base settings to community settings with increased health screening, prevention and care at home. It also presented potential changes to the way hospital services could be provided in Trafford as well as changes to the way elective orthopaedic services are provided at Manchester Royal Infirmary. Specifically:

- The introduction of a consultant-led Urgent Care Centre at Trafford General Hospital to provide services between the hours of 08.00-midnight to replace the current A&E department. This would become a nurse-led minor illness and injuries unit in two to three years subject to further development of integrated care in Trafford
- The Paediatric Observation and Assessment Unit at Trafford General Hospital would close
- Level 3 intensive care, emergency surgery and inpatient surgery (except orthopaedics) would not be provided at Trafford General Hospital. Level 2 high dependency and Level 1 special care would be maintained to provide support to some medical and surgical patients, and this service would be provided using the existing intensive care ward and facilities
- A Medical Receiving Unit at Trafford General Hospital would be able to accept many medical patients with medical and rehabilitation beds to support this function
- An Elective Orthopaedic Centre of Excellence would be established at Trafford General Hospital providing elective inpatient and day case orthopaedic services in existing facilities. Most low and medium risk elective orthopaedic surgery from Manchester Royal infirmary would be transferred to this centre
- Current outpatient services at Trafford General Hospital would remain and be expanded
- More of the existing range of day case surgical services would be carried out at Trafford General Hospital and new procedures potentially added to the service

In October 2012, Trafford Borough Council and Manchester City Council established a joint scrutiny committee for the purposes of responding to the consultation. The JHOSC noted that the proposals affected Trafford and Manchester residents in different ways and agreed to submit their respective responses as the JHOSC response to the consultation.

The Strategic Programme Board considered the JHOSC's response and reviewed other evidence received through the consultation process in late 2012. At a meeting on 19 December 2012, the Strategic Programme Board agreed to recommend to the NHS Greater Manchester Board that it progress the proposals with the addition of a number of preconditions before change was implemented.

The JHOSC met on 14 January 2013 to receive a report from the Strategic Programme Board on its response to the consultation. The JHOSC considered that its concerns had not been addressed and resolved – in the event that NHS Greater Manchester rejected the JHOSC's concerns and opted to proceed with the proposals – to refer the matter to the Secretary of State for Health. The following areas of concern were identified:

- Impact on Wythenshawe Hospital and integrated care in Trafford
- Service reconfiguration tests
- Public consultation
- Clinical evidence base
- Viability of the orthopaedic centre
- Assimilation with forthcoming *Healthier Together* proposals for health services across Greater Manchester

The Strategic Programme Board met on 15 January 2013 and, having considered the further response of the JHOSC, agreed to recommend the proposals to the NHS Greater Manchester Board subject to the following recommendations/conditions:

- The development of additional Integrated Care services for some parts of the Borough, specifically Partington and Carrington, before changes take place to the Accident and Emergency service
- The identification of appropriate pathways for those affected with mental health issues and who currently access services at Trafford General A&E department at night. These pathways are to be identified before any proposed changes take place to the A&E service
- The investment in a subsidy for local Link (dial-a-ride) services, to access alternative hospital sites when needed, should be made before any changes to Trafford hospital services are made
- The health transport bureau should be substantially in place before any changes to Trafford hospital services are made
- The ICRB should be tasked to develop a set of clinical criteria which outline the circumstances under which a safe move from the proposed urgent care centre to the proposed minor injuries unit can be made
- Prior to any service changes, an assurance process should be established to further ensure alternative provider capacity is in place and services can be safely moved

The NHS Greater Manchester Board considered the recommendations of the Strategic Programme Board and the JHOSC's concerns at a meeting on 24 January 2013. The proposals were agreed subject to the recommendations/conditions set out by the Strategic Programme Board (as above).

The JHOSC wrote to the secretary of State on 8 February 2013 to refer the proposals.

Basis for referral

The referral letter of 8 February 2013 states that:

“Given the failure of NHS GM to adequately address the concerns of the Joint Committee, we wish to refer this proposal to the Secretary of State for Health as a substantial variation which is not in the interests of the health service and patients of the Borough of Trafford and the City of Manchester. This is in order to allow further time for the concerns of the JHOSC to be addressed, and to direct commissioners to put the New Health Deal for Trafford proposals in abeyance. The proposals could then be considered alongside the Greater Manchester's Healthier together programme which is addressing related issues in a broader context and which could well allow scope for a wider range of appropriate solutions.”

IRP view

With regard to the referral by the Trafford and Manchester JHOSC, the Panel notes that:

- Work to develop an integrated care system in Trafford has been ongoing since 2008
- An extensive programme of engagement with stakeholders was conducted and the formal consultation process outlined to the relevant HOSCs prior to consultation commencing
- NCAT noted that while there are currently (15 May 2012) no concerns about the clinical safety of services at Trafford General Hospital there is a pressing clinical case to consider the medium and long term future of services
- This is due to falling activity levels leading to concerns about sustaining the competency and skills of medical staff
- Concerns about the sustainability at a safe and high quality level of intensive care and acute surgery in particular have knock-on effects for related services
- Trafford General Hospital has a history of worsening financial deficits with the forecast deficit for 2012/13 expected to be in the region of £19m
- The NHS Greater Manchester Board decision was subject to six recommendations/conditions regarding the development of additional integrated care services, appropriate pathways for accessing mental health services, subsidies for local dial-a-ride services, introduction of a health transport bureau, developing criteria for the transition from urgent care centre to minor injuries unit and establishing an assurance process for alternative provider capacity
- The *Healthier Together* programme, initially intended for public consultation in spring 2013, is understood to be subject to delay

Conclusion

The IRP offers its advice on a case-by-case basis taking account of the specific circumstances and issues of each referral. **The Panel does not consider that a full review would add any value.**

Trafford General Hospital is a small hospital with the second smallest A&E department in the country. The low volume of patients using this and other services at the hospital create problems with staff recruitment and skill development as has been identified by NCAT. These problems are only expected to worsen over time leading to concerns about the safety and quality of services provided at the hospital in the future. Coupled with the financial difficulties being experienced, the case for change seems clear.

Proposals for the establishment of an integrated care system providing more care in the community and at home have been developed and appear to be broadly accepted – certainly the concerns raised by the JHOSC do not relate to the suitability or otherwise of the proposed new care system. Rather, they seem to centre primarily on quite reasonable matters of assurance relating to the impact on A&E services at Wythenshawe Hospital and the capacity of the integrated care service to cope with local needs. Assurance is also sought on the proposed future transition to a minor injuries unit at Trafford General Hospital and on the viability of the proposed orthopaedic centre.

It is reasonable, and in line with current DH policy, to expect that alternative services will be in place before changes are made to existing services. The NHS Greater Manchester Board has agreed the proposals subject to six recommendations/conditions. The Panel agrees that these provisos represent a sensible stepwise approach offering appropriate opportunities for evaluation of progress that can be carried out in conjunction with the JHOSC.

The JHOSC has asked that implementation of the proposals be delayed pending further consideration of its concerns and also to allow the proposals to be considered alongside the forthcoming Greater Manchester-wide *Healthier Together* programme. The Panel understands that plans to hold a formal consultation on the *Healthier Together* programme are the subject of some delay and that consultation is not now expected to take place until later in the year. It is unfortunate that this delay appears not to have been communicated to the JHOSC.

In this context, the Panel considers that it would not be in the best interests of patients and residents of Trafford and Manchester to defer the commencement of the *New Health Deal for Trafford* implementation programme and that, as described above, sufficient time exists within a stepwise approach to implementation to provide the necessary assurance on the matters raised.

Yours sincerely



Independent Reconfiguration Panel
Tel: 020 7389 8045/6

E Mail: info@irpanel.org.uk

Website: www.irpanel.org.uk

IRP

Lord Ribeiro CBE
Chairman, IRP

Independent Reconfiguration Panel
Tel: 020 7389 8045/6

E Mail: info@irpanel.org.uk Website: www.irpanel.org.uk

APPENDIX ONE

LIST OF DOCUMENTS RECEIVED

Trafford and Manchester Joint Health Scrutiny Committee

- 1 Letter of referral from Cllrs Eddy Newman and Judith Lloyd to Secretary of State for Health, 8 February 2012
Attachments:
- 2 Minutes of the JHOSC, 29 October 2012
- 3 Engagement overview
- 4 SPB membership and terms of reference
- 5 Minutes of the SPB, 29 November 2012
- 6 Minutes of the SPB, 19 December 2012
- 7 Minutes of the JHOSC, 14 January 2013
- 8 Minutes of the SPB, 15 January 2013
- 9 Decision statement from NHS Greater Manchester, letter to Cllr Eddy Newman, Manchester City Council from Prof Eileen Fairhurst, Chairman NHS Greater Manchester, 7 February 2013

NHS Northwest

- 1 IRP template for providing initial assessment information
Attachments:
- 2 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Pre-Consultation Business Case, June 2012
- 3 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Engagement Report, March 2012
- 4 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Report on the consultation process
- 5 NCAT report, 15 May 2012
- 6 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Service Reconfiguration – 4 tests assurance process, 27 March 2013
- 7 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Report regarding Transport implications, 12 December 2012
- 8 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Report of consultation with local transport providers, commissioners and interested stakeholders, November 2012
- 9 Trafford workforce information request, 5 February 2013
- 10 Inspection report, Altrincham General Hospital, 8 January 2012
- 11 Inspection report, Trafford General Hospital, 18 September 2012
- 12 Dignity and nutrition for older people, Review of compliance, Trafford General Hospital, June 2011
- 13 A New Health Deal for Trafford. A consultation on plans to redesign hospital services in Trafford. Full document.
- 14 A New Health Deal for Trafford. A consultation on plans to redesign hospital services in Trafford. Summary document.
- 15 A New Health Deal for Trafford. A consultation on plans to redesign hospital services in Trafford. Consultation response form.
- 16 Minutes of the Trafford Strategic Programme Board, 29 November 2012

- 17 Minutes of the Trafford Strategic Programme Board, 19 December 2012
- 18 Minutes of the Trafford Strategic Programme Board, 15 January 2013
- 19 Minutes of meeting of NHS greater Manchester Board, 24 January 2013
- 20 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Integrated Care Redesign Board. Report to Strategic Programme Board
- 21 Paper for Strategic Programme Board. Provider capacity, 19 December 2012
- 22 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Public consultation. Equality Analysis, 7 December 2012
- 23 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Communication and engagement process – a review by the Public Reference Group, December 2012
- 24 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Consultation responses evaluation, final report, 28 November 2012
- 25 Proposed reconfiguration of services at Trafford General Hospital, paper for NHS North of England Board meeting, 12 July 2012
- 26 Minutes of Trafford Strategic programme Board, 6 June 2012
- 27 Attendance sheets for A New Health Deal for Trafford meetings
- 28 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Notes from Clinical Workshop, 29 March 2012
- 29 A New Health Deal for Trafford. Clinical Redesign Event – Secondary Care Medical Models, 12 January 2012
- 30 Trafford Integrated Clinical Redesign Board, Terms of Reference
- 31 Governance and decision making arrangements of Trafford Strategic Programme Board. Paper for NHS Greater Manchester Board meeting, 8 March 2012
- 32 Letter to communication and Engagement Team, NHS Trafford, from Trafford CCG, 17 October 2012
- 33 Letter to Mrs L Williams, Director of Service Transformation, from South Manchester CCG, 7 June 2012
- 34 Letter to Mrs L Williams, Director of Service Transformation, from central Manchester CCG, 13 June 2012
- 35 Letter to Mrs L Williams, Director of Service Transformation, from NHS Trafford, 11 July 2012
- 36 Minutes of pathfinder CCG Committee, 26 June 2012
- 37 Minutes of meeting of Trafford CCG and NHS Trafford Quarterly Forum, 28 June 2012
- 38 Minutes of meeting of Trafford Commissioning forum and NHS Trafford, 21 March 2012
- 39 Letter to Mrs L Williams, Director of Service Transformation, from Central Manchester CCG, 29 October 2012
- 40 Letter to Mrs L Williams, Director of Service Transformation, from Central Manchester CCG, 31 October 2012

Other information received

- 1 Clarification provided by NHS Greater Manchester
Incorporating:

- 2 Decision statement from NHS Greater Manchester, letter to Cllr Eddy Newman, Manchester City Council from Prof Eileen Fairhurst, Chairman NHS Greater Manchester, 7 February 2013
- 3 Draft minutes of NHS Greater Manchester Board meeting, 24 January 2013